

Message Text

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 GENEVA 03797 01 OF 02 211454Z

43

ACTION IO-14

INFO OCT-01 NEA-10 ADP-00 AF-10 ARA-16 EA-11 EUR-25 RSC-01

AID-20 CIAE-00 COME-00 EB-11 FRB-02 INR-10 NSAE-00

TRSE-00 XMB-07 OPIC-12 CIEP-02 LAB-06 SIL-01 OMB-01

DODE-00 PM-07 H-03 L-03 NSC-10 PA-03 PRS-01 SS-15

USIA-15 AGR-20 RSR-01 /238 W
----- 021728

R 211133Z JUL 73

FM USMISSION GENEVA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 642
INFO AMEMBASSY BEIRUT
AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV
USMISSION USUN NEW YORK

UNCLAS SECTION 1 OF 2 GENEVA 3797

EO 11652: N/A

TAGS: ECOSOC

SUBJ: ECOSOC 55 - ITEM 9 (C) ASIAN ECONOMIC COMMISSION

1. SUMMARY - ECONOMIC COMMITTEE RESUMED DEBATE ON ITEM JULY 20 AT 5 PM. AMB GHORRA REJECTED US AND NETHERLANDS AMENDMENTS TO HIS RESOLUTION. AMB. FERGUSON THEN INTRODUCED US DRAFT RESOLUTION PROPOSING REFERRAL OF QUESTION TO ICJ. ALGERIA ARGUED THAT ARABS HAD RIGHT TO "BAND TOGETHER" IN REC. GHORRA DESCRIBED US RES AS A DILATORY MEASURE AND REITERATED THAT ARABS WOULD INSIST ON DEALING WITH ITEM AT THIS 55TH SESSION. AN ISRAELI INTERVENTION LED TO A STATEMENT BY NESTERENKO (USSR) IN WHICH HE ATTACKED ISRAEL FOR ENVOKING "LOFTY PRINCIPLES" WHICH USSR SAID ISRAEL ITSELF HAD NOT LIVED UP TO. CHAIRMAN SCOTT THEN ADJOURNED THE DEBATE AND ANNOUNCED THAT IT WOULD BE RESUMED AT AN UNDERTERMINED TIME NEXT WEEK. END SUMMARY

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 GENEVA 03797 01 OF 02 211454Z

2. AMB GHORRA SAID THAT AMENDMENTS PROPOSED BY US AND

THE NETHERLANDS WERE UNACCEPTABLE TO ALL OF THE DELS OF STATES INTERESTED IN ESTABLISHING WAREC. HE ALSO SAID THAT INTERESTED STATES WOULD INSIST ON DEALING WITH THE ISSUE AT THIS SESSION. HE REJECTED ANY IMPLICATION THAT IT WAS HE PERSONALLY WHO INSISTED ON PURSUING THE ISSUE NOW, SAYING THAT HE WAS INSISTING IN THE NAME OF ALL MEMBER STATES OF THE AREA INTERESTED IN CREATING THE REC. GHORRA RECALLED HIS STATEMENT AT THE RESUMED SESSION OF 53RD ECOSOC RE HIS WILLINGNESS TO POSTPONE CONSIDERATION OF THE ITEM TO THE 55TH SESSION. HE ALSO QUOTED RESPONSES OF ZAGORIN AND MCCARTHY (UK) TO HIS STATEMENT AT 53RD SESSION.

3. GHORRA CONTINUED, SAYING THAT HE WAS SURPRISED AT THE VEHEMENCE OF US STATEMENT EARLIER IN DAY. HE SAID THAT UNFORTUNATELY INTERESTED DELS COULD NOT AGREE TO THE SUGGESTED LINES OF SOLUTION SUGGESTED BY AMB. GERGUSON IN THAT STATEMENT. HE WENT ON TO SAY THAT OTHER STATMENTS MADE IN THE COURSE OF THE MORNINGS DEBATE IN DEFENSE OF ISRAEL HAD INDICATED TO HIM THE REAL REASONS FOR OPPOSITION TO HIS PROPOSAL AND RESOLUTION. HE THEN REVERTED TO HIS EARLIER ARGUMENTATION RE THE POLITICAL REALITIES OF THE ME, THE UNDER PRIVILEGED SITUATION OF THE ARAB STATES WITHIN THE UN SYSTEM. TURNING TO THE GDR CASE, HE SAID THAT ONLY "POLITICAL REALITIES", NOT LEGAL ARGUMENTS HAD KEPT THE GDR OUT OF ECE. AS REGARDS OPPOSITION TO HIS PROPOSAL BASED ON IDEA THAT IT DISCRIMINATED AGAINST ONE STATE IN THE REGION, HE SAID THIS COULD NOT STAND UP AGAINST HIS ARGUMENT THAT THE PRESENT SITUATION DISCRIMINATED AGAINST 12 ARAB STATES OF REGION. HE SAID IT WAS IMPOSSIBLE TO VISUALIZE ISRAEL SITTING WITH 12 ARAB STATES IN A REC. ALTHOUGH SAYING THAT IT WAS "UNPRECEDENTED" FOR A REC TO BE ESTABLISHED WITH MEMBERSHIP AS PROPOSED IN HIS RES, IT WAS ALSO UNPRECEDENTED THAT THE UN WOULD ALLOW A MEMBER STATE TO MAINTAIN TROOPS ON THE TERRITORY OF THREE ARAB MEMBER STATES, AND ALLOWS IT TO DEFEY THE CHARTER, RULES AND RESES OF THE UN.

4. AS REGARDS THE CHARGE THAT HIS PROPOSAL REPRESENTED THE SETTING UP OF AN ETHNIC REC, HE SAID THAT

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 GENEVA 03797 01 OF 02 211454Z

ALTHOUGH THIS HAD APPEARED TO BE THE CASE IN EARLIER DRAFTS OF HIS RES SINCE EARLIER DRAFTS CALLED FOR AN ARAB REC, HE MAINTAINED THAT THIS WAS NO LONGER THE CASE. HE CITED HIS EARLIER OFFER TO ADMIT IRAN, TURKEY AND CYPRUS INTO THE REC AS EVIDENCE THAT HIS RES NOT BASED ON ETHNIC CONSIDERATIONS. IN DEFENSE OF THE LEGALITY OF HIS RES, HE CITED THE CHARTER RE "JOINT AND SEPARATE ACTION". HE SAID THAT

AT PRESENT STAGE OF EVENTS IN THE REGION, ONLY THING
POSSIBLE IS THAT--JOINT AND SEPARATE ACTION.

5. HE SAID UN HAD LABORED LONG ENOUGH TO ESTABLISH
ISRAEL, AS AMB FERGUSON HAD REMARKED. GHORRA WENT ON
TO SAY THAT THAT CHILD, ISRAEL HAD NOT LIVED IN PEACE
SINCE BIRTH AND HAD CONSTANTLY DEFIED UN LAW AND SC RESES.
HE SAID THAT ISRAEL WAS NOT ENTITLED TO BECOME MEMBER OF
REC WITH OTHERS AGAINST WHICH ISRAEL HAD LAUNCHED WARS.
HE THEN CONCLUDED BY REITERATING THAT 1) HE HOPED FOR
GOOD WILL OF COMMITTEE IN ESTABLISHING REC AT THIS
SESSION; 2) INTERESTED DELS. WOULD INSIST UPON DECISION
AT THIS SESSION; 3) US AND NETHS. AMENDMENTS WERE
UNACCEPTABLE; 4) HE HOPED COMMITTEE WOULD BE SPARED
A POLITICAL DEBATE.

6. AMB. FERGUSON OPENED WITH EXPRESSION OF REGRET THAT
GHORRA HAD NOT ACCEPTED SUGGESTED AMENDMENT OF RES WHICH
WOULD HAVE OVERCOME A GRAVE DEFECT OF THE RES. HE
REITERATED THAT USG HAD SERIOUS DOUBTS RE CONSTITUTION-
ALITY OF RES AND ITS LEGALITY UNDER THE CHARTER. HE
THEN INTRODUCED THE US DRAFT RESOLUTION AND READ IT
OUT.

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 GENEVA 03797 02 OF 02 211504Z

43

ACTION IO-14

INFO OCT-01 NEA-10 ADP-00 AF-10 ARA-16 EA-11 EUR-25 RSC-01

AID-20 CIAE-00 COME-00 EB-11 FRB-02 INR-10 NSAE-00

TRSE-00 XMB-07 OPIC-12 CIEP-02 LAB-06 SIL-01 OMB-01

DODE-00 PM-07 H-03 L-03 NSC-10 PA-03 PRS-01 SS-15

USIA-15 AGR-20 RSR-01 /238 W

----- 021772

R 211133Z JUL 73

FM USMISSION GENEVA

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 643

INFO AMEMBASSY BEIRUT
AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV
USMISSION USUN NEW YORK

UNCLAS SECTION 2 OF 2 GENEVA 3797

7. ALGERIAN REP. IN QUITE VITRIOLIC STATEMENT SAID THAT OFFENSIVE LANGUAGE OF AMB FERGUSON'S STATEMENT EARLIER IN DAY COULD NOT MASK FACT THAT USG HAD FLAUNTED BASIC PRINCIPLES ENVOCKED IN THAT STATEMENT. HE SAID THAT PART USG HAD PLAYED IN ESTABLISHMENT OF ISRAEL WAS WELL KNOWN. HE SAID THAT GOI REPRESENTS GREATEST MENACE TO REGION AND WORLD AND THAT HE COULD NOT THEREFORE ACCEPT AMB. FERGUSON'S SUGGESTION SINCE THEY APPEARED TO PUT THE AGGRESSOR AND THE AGGRESSED ON AN EQUAL LEVEL.

8. AMB. GHORRA INTERVENED ONCE AGAIN TO DESCRIBE US RESOLUTION AS A DILATORY MEASURE DESIGNED TO OPEN A FILLIBUSTER. HE QUESTIONED THE COUNCIL'S POWERS UNDER ARTILCE 96 OF THE CHARTER TO REQUEST ADVISORY OPINIONS OF TE ICJ, SAYING THAT IT APPEARED TO HIM THAT THE COUNCIL COULD DO SO ONLY WITH THE AUTHORITY OF THE SC OR GA. HE REITERATED THAT ARABS' DETERMINATION TO SETTLE THE ISSUE AT THIS SESSION. AMB. FERGUSON IN UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 GENEVA 03797 02 OF 02 211504Z

BRIEF INTERVENTION POINTED OUT THAT THE GA HAD AUTHORIZED COUNCIL TO REQUEST THE COURT'S OPINIONS IN RES 89 (I).

9. THE COMMITTEE THEN HEARD A STATEMENT FROM THE ISRAELI OBSERVER IN WHICH HE EXRESEED REGRET THAT GHORRA HAD INTRODUCED ACRIMONIOUS, INACCURATE AND EXAGGERATED ISSUES INTO THE COUNCIL. HE DESCRIBED GHORRA'S STATEMENTS AS BEING LIKE THOSE HEARD SO FREQUENTLY IN THE SC, AND EXPRESSED OPINION THAT THEY WERE OUT OF ORDER IN THE ECOSOC. ISRAELI THOUGHT THAT GHORRA'S STATEMENTS HAD EXHIBITED THE EXCLUSIVELY POLITICAL MOTIVATION OF THE RES ESTABLISHING THE WAREC. HE CITED THE REPERTORY OF UN LEGAL PRACTISE ON SUBJECT OF REC MEMBERSHIP TO EFFECT THAT ALL MEMBER STATES OF A REGION SHOULD BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATED IN REC ON FOOTING OF EQUALITY. HE REVIEWED HISTORY OF ATTEMPTS TO ESTABLISH REC IN ME SINCE 1948 AND SAID THAT BAISIC SITUATION HAD NOT CHANGED SINCE ARAB REFUSAL OF 1948 TO JOIN IN REC INCLUDING ISRAEL AND CONSEQUENT SUSPENSION OF THE MATTER. HE SAID THAT HE BELIEVED THIS TO BE A PARTICULARLY INOPPORTUNE TIME TO BRING UP THIS ISSUE AGAIN AND

SAID THAT COMMITTEE SHOULD NOT SANCTION ESTABLISHMENT OF AN INSTITUTION WHICH WOULD EXCLUDE ONE STATE AND PERPETUATE A SITUATION SEPARATING STATES ONE FROM ANOTHER. DESCRIBING THE LEBANESE RES AS VIOLATING THE PRINCIPLES AND PRACTICES OF THE UN, HE SAID THAT IF THE COUNCIL ADOPTED THE RES, ISRAEL WOULD FORMALLY REJECT THE RES, AND IN VIEW OF ITS FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS, THE GOI WOULD HAVE TO REVIEW THE QUESTION OF ITS CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE REGULAR BUDGET. HE CONCLUDED BY NOTING THAT ISRAEL'S POSITION RE UNESOB REMAINS UNCHANGED.

10. NESTERENKO (USSR) OPENED BY SAYING THAT GHORRA HAD PROPERLY DEFENDED HIS RES, BUT THAT ISRAELI STATEMENT OBLIGED USSR TO CHANGE ITS MIND AND SPEAK ON THE ITEM. HE SAID THAT THE ISRAELI STATEMENT TO EFFECT THAT LEBANESE RES WAS TYPE OF "SORCERY" WAS TOO MUCH. HE SAID THAT IF ANY DEL EMPLOYING SORCERY, IT WAS ISRAEL, WHO MAKING USE OF OTHER DELGATIONS, HOPED THAT UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 GENEVA 03797 02 OF 02 211504Z

USSR WOULD NOT TAKE FLOOR. HE SAID THAT ISRAELI STATEMENT ENBOKING PRINCIPLES SUCH AS UNIVERSALITY, EQUALITY ETC. WAS A MOCKERY. THE USSR HE SAID THAT ALWAYS FAVORED UNIVERSALITY, WHILE ISRAEL USED IT ONLY TO SERVE ITS OWN PURPOSES AT SELECTED TIMES. HE SAID WHEN AGGRSSORS REQUEST TO JOIN A UN ORGANIZATION, THE PRINCIPLE OF UNIVERSALITY IS TURNED ON ITS HEAD. TURNING TO THE ARGUMENT OF PEOPLE VS GOVERNMENTS, HE SAID HE WISHED TO MAKE CLEAR THAT HE WISHES BEST TO PEOPLE BUT COULD NOT OVERLOOK FACT THAT GOI HAD BEEN CONDEMNED IN UN RESES. HE MAINTAINED THAT THE GOI HAD VIOLATED UN CHARTER PRINCIPLES OF PEACE, SECURITY AND DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION. HE SAID GOI POLICY PREVENTS IT FROM PARTICIPATING IN REC. NESTERENKO, DRAWING ATTENTION TO GHORRA'S REMARKS THAT ISRAEL OCCUPIED TERRITORY OF SOME ARAB STATES, SAID THAT LEAVING POLITICAL ARGUMENTATION ASIDE THIS FACT ALONE CREATES AN ABSURD SITUATION. HE SAID FROM OUTSET THERE MUST BE A PEACEFUL POLICY IN AREA. UNDER PEACEFUL CIRCUMSTANCES, THE SITUATION COULD CHANGE. HE RETURNED THEN TO FACT THAT GOI TO DATE HAD REFUSED TO HEED DECISIONS OF SC AND CONCLUDED BY SAYING THAT AGGRESSIVE POLICY OF GOI IS COUNTER TO UN PRINCIPLES AND CHARTER.

11. CHAIRMAN SCOTT THEN ANNOUNCED THAT COMMITTEE WOULD RECESS AND THAT THE ITEM ON WAREC WOULD BE TAKEN UP AGAIN AT SOME FUTURE TIME TO BE ANNOUNCED. BASSIN

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01 JAN 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: n/a
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 21 JUL 1973
Decaption Date: 01 JAN 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: n/a
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: n/a
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment:
Disposition Date: 01 JAN 1960
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1973GENEVA03797
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: N/A
Errors: N/A
Film Number: n/a
From: GENEVA
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1973/newtext/t19730718/aaaaanfi.tel
Line Count: 276
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE
Office: ACTION IO
Original Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 6
Previous Channel Indicators:
Previous Classification: n/a
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: n/a
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: kellerpr
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 18 DEC 2001
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <18-Dec-2001 by thomasv0>; APPROVED <31-Jan-2002 by kellerpr>
Review Markings:

Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
30 JUN 2005

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: ECOSOC 55 - ITEM 9 (C) ASIAN ECONOMIC COMMISSION
TAGS: EGEN, ECOSOC
To: STATE
Type: TE
Markings: Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 30 JUN 2005